

Wŏnhyo's Philosophy of Mind

International Association for Wŏnhyo Studies'
Collected Works of Wŏnhyo, Volume 2

Edited by A. Charles Muller and Cuong T. Nguyen

Table of Contents

I. Wŏnhyo's Philosophy of Mind: Introduction	9
1. Buddhist Philosophy of Mind in East Asia.....	10
A. Grounding in Basic Buddhist Philosophical and Soteriological Approaches.....	10
B. Madhyamaka: Dependent Arising and Emptiness (<i>sūnyatā</i>)	15
C. Problems with Transmission of Karma and Abhidharmic Solutions	18
D. The Need for a More Detailed Map of Consciousness	19
E. Yogâcāra: the Middle Path and Mind-Only	20
F. Liberation in Yogâcāra	25
G. Tathāgatagarbha.....	26
H. Intermixture.....	28
I. The Base Consciousness: Pure, Defiled, Neither, or Both	30
J. The Xuanzang Effect.....	31
K. The Fate of East Asian Yogâcāra.....	32
L. Yogâcāra Influences on Wŏnhyo	33
M. Buddhist Logic	38
2. Wŏnhyo as "Harmonizer".....	39
A. The Meaning of <i>Hwajaeng</i>	39
B. Not doing <i>pangyo</i>	41
C. Approaches to the Study of <i>Hwajaeng</i>	42
D. Wŏnhyo's Writings, Logic, and Modes of Inquiry	44
E. Philological Analysis: Terminological Bases for <i>Hwajaeng</i>	47
F. Paradigmatic Bases for Wŏnhyo's Perspective of Harmonization.....	52
i. The One Mind.....	53
ii. Two Truths.....	55
G. Harmonization, Faith, and Distance from Language	58
i. Linguistic <i>hwajaeng</i> and non-linguistic <i>hwajaeng</i>	58
ii. Non-conceptual faith as the final destination.....	61
3. The Texts	65
II. System of the Two Hindrances (<i>Yijang ūi</i>).....	67
1. Introduction	68
A. Acknowledgments.....	68
B. Introduction	70
i. The Two Hindrances.....	70
a. Development of the Hindrances	70
b. Defining the Hindrances in Detail	75
ii. Process of the Development of Two Hindrances Systems	77
a. The Tathāgatagarbha System of the Hindrances as Explained by Huiyuan	78
b. The Yogâcāra System of the Hindrances.....	82
c. Completing the Yogâcāra Hindrances System: The Fodi jing lun [FDJL] and Cheng weishi lun [CWSL]	84

<i>d. The Awakening of Mahāyāna Faith and the Composition of the Yijing ūi: The Indirect Approach to the Hindrances</i>	86
iii. The Legacy of the Hindrances in East Asia.....	90
iv. Content Analysis.....	92
1. A brief introductory first chapter	92
2. The Essence of the Hindrances	92
3. The Function of the Hindrances.....	94
4. The Categories of the Hindrances.....	95
5. Counteracting and Eliminating the Hindrances	96
6. Resolution of Discrepancies.....	97
v. Textual History and Notes on the Translation	97
2. Translation.....	100
A. Prologue and Definition of Terminology.....	100
i. Prologue	100
ii. Definition of Terminology.....	100
B. The Essence of the Hindrances	102
i. The Direct Approach.....	102
a. Showing the Essence of the Hindrances from the Point of View of their Nature	102
b. Examining the Essence of the Hindrances from the Perspective of the Eight Consciousnesses and the Three [Karmic Moral] Qualities	103
1. The Afflictive Hindrances	103
a. Within the Eight Consciousnesses	103
b. Within the Three [Karmic Moral] Qualities	105
2. The Cognitive Hindrances	108
a. In the Eight Consciousnesses.....	108
b. The Three Qualities	112
c. The Essences of the Two Hindrances from the Perspectives of Active Binding and Latency.....	116
d. The Essences of the Hindrances in Terms of the Afflictions Proper and their Habituated Tendencies (Vāsanās).....	120
1. Habituated Tendencies that Function in Specific Situations	120
2. Pervasive habit energies	121
e. The Essences of the Hindrances from the Perspective of the Five Categories of Dharmas.....	124
f. The Essence of the Two Hindrances from the Indirect Perspective.....	125
C. The Function of the Hindrances	127
i. The Direct Interpretation.....	127
a. The Afflictive Hindrances.....	127
1. The Function of Producing Karma	127
2. The Momentum of the Continuity of Rebirth.....	130
b. The Cognitive Hindrances.....	136
ii. The Function of the Two Hindrances According to the Indirect Perspective.....	137
a. Generation of Karma	137
b. Momentum of Rebirth.....	140
D. The Categories of the Hindrances	141
i. The 128 Afflictions	141
ii. The 104 Afflictions.....	145
iii. The Ninety-Eight Declivities.....	146
iv. The Eight Kinds of Deluded Conceptualization	149
v. The Three Categories of Affliction.....	153
vi. The Two Categories of Affliction.....	154
E. Counteracting and Eliminating the Hindrances.....	161
i. The Antidotes.....	161
a. The Definition Based on Scriptural Authority.....	162
b. The Definition Based on the Inner Realization of the Supreme Truth.....	164
1. The Relationship of the Manas with the Manovijñāna and Ālayavijñāna	164

2. Elimination of the Hindrances in the Two Kinds of Cognition and the Five Paths	170
a. The Five Paths	170
b. The Two Kinds of Cognition	174
ii. Identification of that which is Eliminated	176
a. <i>The Identification of that which is Eliminated in Terms of Primary and Secondary</i>	176
b. <i>The Identification of that which is Eliminated from the Perspective of the Activity and Quelling</i>	178
c. <i>The Identification of that which is Eliminated in terms of General and Specific</i>	178
d. <i>The Identification of that which is Eliminated According to the Time</i>	179
iii. Distinctions in Quelling and Eliminating	182
a. <i>The Distinctions between Quelling and Eliminating</i>	182
b. <i>The Distinctions in the Elimination of the Fetters</i>	184
c. <i>The Distinctions in Release from the Bondages</i>	186
iv. Correction and Elimination in the Various Levels [of Practitioners]	187
a. <i>From the Approach of the Non-Sameness of Purity and Impurity</i>	187
1. Correction and Elimination at the Stage of Worldling	187
2. Antidotes in the Level of the Two Vehicles	188
a. The Direct Perspective	188
b. The Indirect Perspective	194
3. The Stages of Elimination in the Bodhisattva Path	195
a. Direct and Indirect Perspectives	195
b. Arisen Afflictions	196
c. Entrenched Afflictions	201
b. <i>From the Perspective of Non-Obstruction between Purity and Impurity</i>	202
F. Resolution of Discrepancies	203
i. Question 1: Relationship between Counteracting the Afflictions of the Desire Realm and Attaining the Realization of Non-Returner	203
ii. Question 2: Relationship between the Liberation Attained in the Realms of Form and Formlessness	204
iii. Question 3: Relationship of Sentient Beings to the Three Realms	205
iv. Question 4: Placement of the Adherents of the Two Vehicles in the Framework of the Mahāyāna Path	208
v. Question 5: How Can the Manas Cognize All Dharmas?	210
a. <i>Proof Through Inference</i>	210
1. Proof of Valid Claims	210
2. Refutation of Error	211
b. <i>The Argument Based on Scriptural Authority</i>	211
vi. Coarseness and Subtlety in the Nescience Entrenchment	212
III. Treatise on the Ten Ways of Resolving Controversies (<i>Simmun hwajaeng non</i>)	218
1. Introduction	219
2. Translation	223
A. Causes of Controversies	223
B. Being and Emptiness	223
C. The Opponent's View	224
D. Wŏnhyo's Response: Words and Reality	224
E. Language and Emptiness	225
F. The Three Natures and Reality	225
G. Canonical Sources	226
H. Non-duality and the Universality of Buddha-nature]	228
I. Buddha-nature is Without Beginning and Without End	230
J. The Two Kinds of Selflessness	232
IV. Commentary on the Discrimination Between the Middle and the Extremes (<i>Chungbyŏn punbyŏllon so</i>): Fascicle Three	236
1. Introduction	237

I. The <i>Madhyântavibhāga-bhāṣya</i>	237
II. The Content of Chapter Four of the <i>Madhyântavibhāga-bhāṣya</i>	238
III. The Mahāyāna Approach to the Thirty-Seven Constituents of Awakening	239
IV. An Overview of Wŏnhyo's Commentary	241
V. Wŏnhyo And The East Asian Commentarial Style.....	241
VI. The Style of the <i>Chungbyŏn punbyŏllon so</i>	243
VII. Wŏnhyo's Authoritative Sources	244
VIII. Wŏnhyo's Commentarial Structure	244
IX. On Translating the <i>Chungbyŏn punbyŏllon so</i>	245
2. Translation	247
A. Chapter On the Antidotes.....	247
I. Introduction	247
II. Commentary	247
II.1. Enumerating the Names of the Thirty-Seven Constituents of Awakening.....	247
II. 2. Explaining the Meaning of the Thirty-Seven Constituents of Awakening.....	249
II. 2. 1. The Four Foundations of Mindfulness.....	249
II. 2. 2. The Four Right Eliminations	251
II. 2. 3. The Four Legs of Supernormal Powers	253
II. 2. 4. The Five Spiritual Faculties.....	256
II. 2. 5. The Five Powers	257
II. 2. 6. The Seven Awakening Limbs.....	257
II. 2. 7. The Eight Limbs of the Noble Path	257
II. 3. Illustrating the Essence of the Thirty-Seven Constituents of Awakening	258
II. 4. Elucidating the Stages And Levels of the Thirty-Seven Constituents of Awakening....	260
II. 5. Clarifying the Orders of the Thirty-Seven Constituents of Awakening.....	262
II. 6. Discriminating the Divisions of the Thirty-Seven Constituents of Awakening	265
II. 6. 1. The Five Divisions.....	265
II. 6. 1. 1. The Five Divisions of the Four Foundations of Mindfulness	265
II. 6. 1. 2. The Five Divisions of the Four Right Eliminations	271
II.6.1.3. The Five Divisions of the Four Legs of Supernormal Powers.....	272
II. 6. 1. 4.. The Five Divisions of the Five Spiritual Faculties.....	276
II. 6. 1. 5. The Five Divisions of the Five Powers	277
II. 6. 1. 6. The Five Divisions of the Seven Awakening Limbs.....	277
II. 6. 1. 7. The Five Divisions of the Eight Limbs of the Noble Path.....	281
III. AN ANALYSIS OF THE WORDS OF THE CHAPTER.....	283
III. 1. The Four Foundations of Mindfulness	284
III. 2. The Four Right Endeavors	286
III. 3. The Four Wish-Granting Legs	287
III. 4. The Five Spiritual Faculties.....	298
III. 5. The Five Powers.....	303
III. 6. The Seven Awakening Limbs	308
III. 7. The Eight Limbs of the Noble Path	311
1. The Antidotes And the Three Obstructions.....	316
2. The Three Kinds of Antidotes	318
3. Distinctions [Between the Vehicles]	320
B. The Stages of Cultivation.....	321
I. Four Stages And Eighteen Levels.....	322
I. 1. The Seven Levels of Cause In the Shared Stages	324
I. 2. The Distinct Stages	325
III. 3. The Successive Levels.....	326
III. 4. The Simultaneous Levels	326
IV. Level of the Realm of Reality.....	327
C. On the Attainment of Fruits	329
I. The Characteristics of the Five Fruits.....	330

II. The Essence of the Fruits	331
III. The Divisions of Cause	332
IV. Explaining the Words	333
V. The Ten Fruits	335
VI. A Summary	339
VI. The Meaning of the Levels in the Stages of Cultivation of the Antidotes.....	341
VIII. The Meaning of Fruits.....	342
IX. A Conclusion On the Meaning of the Three Chapters.....	344
V. Critical Discussion on Inference.....	346
1. Introduction	347
A. The Manuscript is Incomplete.....	348
B. Brief Overview of the Early Development of Buddhist <i>Hetuvidyā</i>	350
C. Buddhist Logic Comes to China and Korea: Lü Cai and the Fiasco over the <i>Nyāyapraveśa</i> ..	352
D. How a Dignāgan Proof Works.....	353
E. The <i>Nyāyamukha</i> and Wŏnhyo	361
F. <i>Critical Discussion on Inference</i> (K. <i>P'an Piryang non</i>)	368
G. Editions Consulted	371
2. Translation	373
VI. Bibliography.....	386
1. East Asian Canonical Collections.....	387
2. East Asian Canonical Sources	388
3. Modern Works	391
VII. Glossary	399
1. Terms	400
2. Persons.....	422
3. Texts and Collections	424

Book Blurb:

Leading East Asian Buddhist thinkers of the seventh century compared, analyzed, and finalized seminal epistemological and soteriological issues that had been under discussion in India and East Asia for centuries. Among the many doctrinal issues that came to the fore was the relationship between the Tathāgatagarbha (or “Buddha-nature”) understanding of the human psyche and the view of basic karmic indeterminacy articulated by the new stream of Indian Yogācāra introduced through the translations and writings of Xuanzang and his disciples. The great Silla scholiast Wŏnhyo (617–686), although geographically located on the periphery in the Korean peninsula, was very much at the center of the intense discussion and debate that occurred on these topics. Through the force of his writings, he became one of the most influential figures in resolving doctrinal discrepancies for East Asian Buddhism.

Although many of Wŏnhyo’s writings are lost, through his extant work we are able to get a solid glimpse of his profound and learned insights on the nature and function of the human mind. We can also clearly see his hermeneutical approaches and methods of argumentation, which are derived from apophatic Mādhyamika analysis, the newly introduced Buddhist logic, as well as various indigenous East Asian approaches. This volume includes four of Wŏnhyo’s works that are especially revelatory of his treatment of the complex flow of ideas in his generation: *System of the Two Hindrances* (*Yijang ūi*), *Treatise on the Ten Ways of Resolving Controversies* (*Simmun hwajaeng non*), *Commentary on the Discrimination between the Middle and the Extremes* (*Chunghyŏn punbyŏllon so*), and the *Critical Discussion on Inference* (*P’an piryang non*).

On Translating *āvaraṇa*

We often see problems derived from translations based purely on linguistic knowledge that is not informed by an understanding of the system within which the term is operating. For example, in the context of Yogâcāra works, we regularly see *zhàng* (障礙) rendered as "veil," or "obscuration." While this is linguistically accurate, such a rendering demonstrates a lack of awareness of the connotations of the term in Yogâcāra/Tathāgatagarbha soteriological discourse.

The application of the term in the Yogâcāra and Tathāgatagarbha systems extends far beyond the cognitive connotations indicated by such words as *veil* and *obscuration*. Especially in the case of the *kleśâvaraṇa*, what is being indicated most of the time is the notion of "binding" (*bandhana*, *saṃyojana*; Ch. *fú* 縛, *jì* 繫); and for both the *kleśâvaraṇa* and *jñeyâvaraṇa*, a major connotation is that of debilitation, rigidity (*dauṣṭhilya*, Ch. *cūzhòng*; 僂重), etc. In the case of the afflictions, we are dealing only tangentially with problems of cognitive distortion that might be indicated by *veil*, etc. And in the case of cognitive hindrances, they are not merely "sky-flowers" or a distorting prism — they represent the whole gamut of wrong cognitive habits that lead to misapprehension of reality. Thus, the rendering of "hindrance," "obstruction," etc., is more appropriate.

Two Traditions of Two Hindrances

Yogâcāra Tradition: *Yogâcārabhūmi-śāstra*, *Samdhinirmocana-sūtra*, *Buddhabhūmisūtra-śāstra* (Fodijing lun 佛地經論), *Mahāyāna-saṃgrāha*, *Cheng weishi lun* 成唯識論, etc. Note: Not *Madhyānta-vibhāga*, which contains an idiosyncratic explanation of the hindrances.

Tathāgatagarbha Tradition: *Śrīmālā-sūtra*, *Benye jing* 本業經, *Ratnagoṭravibhāga*, *Awakening of Mahāyāna Faith* [AMF] 大乘起信論, etc.

Wonhyo first becomes aware of this distinction in the process of writing his earlier commentary on the AMF, and after finishing that commentary conducts a no-stone-left-unturned inquiry into the development of theories of cognitive error and affliction in the Mahāyāna system, resulting in the *Ijangui* 二障義 (System of the Two Hindrances). His articulation of each of the systems of the two hindrances internal to the two traditions alone is by far the most complete ever done in Buddhist scholastic history, but then he juxtaposes the two systems for comparative analysis, revealing all of their subtleties in overlap and difference. Within each of the systems themselves, there is much overlap and grey area between the two, and differences in interpretation, such as the differences in views of the *ālayavijñāna*, *manas*, and *manovijñāna* by various Yogâcāra masters. The Tathāgatagarbha system itself also has a hierarchy of hermeneutical levels through which the relationship between the two kinds of hindrances is perceived differently.

Very generally:

	cognitive hindrances <i>jñeyâvaraṇa</i>	afflictive hindrances <i>kleśâvaraṇa</i>
Yogâcāra	所知障 (Xuanzang) Based on <i>dharma-grāha</i> 法執 Removable by bodhisattvas who perceive emptiness of dharmas.	煩惱障 Based on <i>ātma-grāha</i> . Are the source of the four views of self 四我見 (<i>Trīṃsikā</i>); six fundamental afflictions, 20 derivative afflictions, etc. Removable by arhats who see no-self.
Tathāgata-garbha	智礙 (Paramârtha?) One aspect of nescience 無明 Inability to discriminate phenomena in <i>pr̥ṣṭha-labdha-jñāna</i> 後得智. Thus, obstructs <i>vipaśyanā</i>	煩惱礙 Another aspect of nescience, originating with the first movement of mind from pristine suchness. Generates the three subtle 三細 and six

	Thus, the wise and compassionate activities of bodhisattvas cannot be carried out. Removable in experience of profound faith	coarse 六塵 (afflicted) mental states. Obstructs <i>śamatha</i>.
--	--	---